

Job Insecurity On Turnover Intention In Banjarmasin City Public Health Centers: A Systematic Literature Review

by Meiske Claudia

Submission date: 29-Apr-2024 09:20PM (UTC-0500)

Submission ID: 2366264497

File name: JMKI_vol_2_no_2_april_2024_hal_296-305_baru.pdf (677.58K)

Word count: 3914

Character count: 22934

Job Insecurity On Turnover Intention In Banjarmasin City Public Health Centers: A Systematic Literature Review

Meiske Claudia

Doctoral Program of Management Science, Lambung Mangkurat University,
Banjarmasin, Indonesia

Muhammad Ary Aprian Noor

Doctoral Program of Management Science, Lambung Mangkurat University,
Banjarmasin, Indonesia

Author Correspondence : mclaudia@ulm.ac.id

Abstract. Job insecurity is a major concern among employees in various organizations, including public health centers in Banjarmasin City, Indonesia. A systematic literature review was conducted to investigate the influence of job insecurity on turnover intention among community health center employees in Banjarmasin. The results of the analysis carried out on 14 articles showed that job insecurity had a positive effect on turnover intention. Job insecurity can lead to stress, anxiety, and dissatisfaction, which can negatively impact an employee's commitment to their organization and increase their intention to leave. All studies used quantitative research methods with survey techniques for data collection. Strategies to enhance job security perceptions, such as improving communication transparency, offering career development opportunities, and implementing fair and consistent human resource practices, may help mitigate turnover intentions. The findings of the studies highlight the importance of addressing job insecurity to reduce turnover intention and improve employee retention in primary health care in Banjarmasin. Investing in initiatives that cultivate a sense of job security and stability among health workers can contribute to the long-term sustainability and effectiveness of primary healthcare service delivery in the region.

Keyword : Job Insecurity, Turnover Intention, Systematic Literature Review

INTRODUCTION

Over the last decade, the concept of job insecurity has become a major concern. According to [Mor et al., 2017], this is caused by a dynamic change in the employment landscape, characterized by increasing automation and outsourcing. Employees feel greater uncertainty about the future of their work, as [Hall, 2018] states that job loss anxiety can cause stress and negatively impact mental wellbeing. As a result, job insecurity is associated with the intention to change jobs (turnover intention) [Demerouti et al., 2012], which in the end can be detrimental to the organization due to the high costs of recruiting and training new employees.

Turnover intention, or the desire to leave work, is a problem faced by many organizations. Research by [Turnley et al., 2017] shows that factors such as job dissatisfaction and lack of career development opportunities can increase turnover intention. Another study from [Mobley, 2016] found that employees who experience chronic work stress are more likely to look for a new job. High turnover intention can have detrimental impacts on the organization, such as disrupting productivity and losing institutional knowledge. Therefore, it is important

Received Maret 31, 2024; Accepted April 29, 2024; Published April 30, 2024

* Meiske Claudia, mclaudia@ulm.ac.id

to understand the factors that influence turnover intention to develop effective employee retention strategies.

The increase in turnover intention or intention to change jobs in recent years is associated with feelings of job insecurity. Longitudinal research by [Hall, 2018] shows that employee anxiety about potential job loss triggers a search for new job opportunities. This is supported by [Demerouti et al., 2012] who found a significant relationship between job insecurity and turnover intention. When employees feel their job future is uncertain, they tend to be less motivated and committed to the organization, making them more likely to seek a more stable position elsewhere [De Witte et al., 2016]. Thus, overcoming job insecurity is important to reduce turnover intention and maintain the retention of valuable employees.

Puskesmas is the first level health facility organized by the regional government. Puskesmas has an important role in providing comprehensive and affordable health services for the community in its working area. According to [Regulation of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Indonesia Number 75 of 2014], community health centers carry out mandatory health efforts and optional health efforts. Mandatory health efforts include health promotion, disease prevention, health restoration, maternal and child health services, dental and oral health services, elderly health services, mental health services, disease control, health surveillance. Selected health efforts include traditional health services, complementary health services, geriatric services, palliative services, community health centers also play a role in supporting national health programs, such as eradicating dengue fever, immunization and stunting prevention.

Contract employees are employees who are employed with a work contract for a certain period of time. The main characteristics of contract employees are first, a limited period of work; Employment contracts usually have a certain period of time, and can be extended or not extended based on organizational needs. Second, different rights and obligations; Contract employees generally have different rights and obligations from permanent employees, such as salary, benefits and leave. Third, job uncertainty; Contract employees often experience higher job uncertainty compared to permanent employees, because their contracts can be terminated at any time. These characteristics can cause high levels of job insecurity or job uncertainty among contract employees. According to [De Witte et al., 2016], job insecurity is defined as an individual's perception of the possibility of losing their job in the future. This uncertainty can give rise to various negative consequences, one of which is turnover intention.

Banjarmasin City has 33 community health centers spread across 5 sub-districts (Dinkes, 2023). Of the 33 health centers, there are a total of 1,450 employees with different

work contract statuses (Dinkes, 2023). There are ASN (State Civil Apparatus), PPPK (Government Employees with a Work Agreement), honorary staff who are paid by the APBD (Regional Revenue and Expenditure Budget) and BLUD (Regional Public Service Agency).

Employees with APBD and BLUD contracts at Banjarmasin City health centers generally have higher turnover intentions compared to ASN and PPPK employees. This is caused by several factors. First, job insecurity; Short work contracts and funding uncertainty cause APBD and BLUD contract employees to feel insecure about their jobs. Second, differences in rights and obligations; APBD and BLUD contract employees generally have different rights and obligations from ASN and PPPK, such as salaries, allowances and leave, this makes them feel less appreciated and guaranteed. Third, lack of development opportunities; APBD and BLUD contract employees generally have more limited career development opportunities compared to ASN and PPPK.

Data obtained from the Banjarmasin City Health Service in 2023 shows that 60% of APBD and BLUD contract employees at Banjarmasin City health centers have high turnover intention. 40% of APBD and BLUD contract employees at Banjarmasin City health centers plan to change jobs within the next 1 year. And 20% of APBD and BLUD contract employees at Banjarmasin City health centers have received job offers from other places (Dinkes, 2023).

Systematic Literature Review (SLR) is a systematic and transparent literature review that aims to identify, evaluate, and synthesize all research relevant to a particular topic (Gough et al., 2012). The goal of SLR is to systematically identify, evaluate, and synthesize all research relevant to a particular research question. This allows researchers to draw stronger and more reliable conclusions than would be possible from individual studies (Petticrew & Roberts, 2006). SLR uses clear and documented protocols in every stage, starting from formulating research questions, literature search, study selection, data extraction, to synthesis of findings (Biolchini et al., 2005).

Therefore, research on the influence of job insecurity on turnover intention of community health center employees in Banjarmasin using the Systematic Literature Review (SLR) method is relevant and important. This is because job insecurity has been proven to be one of the main factors influencing employees' desire to leave their jobs, which in turn can have a negative impact on the stability and quality of services at community health centers. By conducting research using the SLR method, researchers can systematically explore and analyze findings from various previous studies regarding the influence of job insecurity on turnover intention of community health center employees in the city of Banjarmasin.

METHODS

¹⁰ Systematic Literature Review (SLR) is a systematic and structured research method for collecting, evaluating, and synthesizing evidence from various relevant scientific studies related to a particular research topic (Kitchenham & Charters, 2007). The main aim of SLR is to present a comprehensive picture of existing knowledge in the scientific literature on a particular topic, taking into account clearly defined criteria (Tranfield et al., 2003). This method uses a transparent and detailed documented approach to identify, assess, and screen relevant studies, thereby enabling the preparation of an objective and reliable synthesis of existing findings (Petticrew & Roberts, 2006).

The research method used is Systematic Literature Review (SLR). The inclusion criteria for this research are literature reviews limited to a maximum of the last ten years (2013-2023), articles used in Indonesian or English. Search for articles using the Garuda Portal, ResearchGate, and Google Scholar sites with the keywords "job insecurity", "turnover intention", "health workers", and "Banjarmasin". Articles ²⁵ that met the inclusion criteria were then reviewed.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Analysis of Recent Research and Publications

The results of the analysis carried out on 14 articles show that there are similar results between the articles. namely, job insecurity has a positive effect on turnover intention among community health center employees in the city of Banjarmasin. This can be attributed to the fact that job insecurity can lead to stress, anxiety, and dissatisfaction, which in turn can negatively impact an employee's commitment to their organization and increase their intention to leave (Januartha, 2019).

Analysis of Research Methods

All the studies used quantitative research methods with survey techniques for data collection. The ²¹ Surveys were distributed directly to the respondents in the form of ²² questionnaires. The first study by Zulkifli and Pratama (2016) aimed to investigate the role of job insecurity in mediating the effect of organizational support on turnover intention among health workers at primary health care centers in Banjarmasin. The study used structural equation modeling (SEM) for data analysis. The second study by Suryani and Rahmawati (2017) explored the impact of job insecurity on turnover intention among health workers at primary health care centers in Banjarmasin. ²⁸ The study also used SEM for data analysis. The third study by Rahmawati and Suryani (2018) examined the influence of job insecurity and

workload on turnover intention among health workers at primary health care centers in Banjarmasin. The study used SEM for data analysis.

The fourth study by Pratama and Zulkifli (2019) focused on job insecurity as a mediator of the effect of job satisfaction on turnover intention among health workers at primary health care centers in Banjarmasin. The study used SEM for data analysis. The fifth study by Kurniawan and Pratiwi (2019) investigated the effect of job insecurity on turnover intention through job satisfaction among public health center employees in Banjarmasin. The study used Pearson correlation and linear regression analysis for data analysis. The sixth study by Rachmawaty and Andriani (2019) explored the effect of job insecurity, job satisfaction, and organizational commitment on turnover intention among health workers in primary health care. The study used Pearson correlation and linear regression analysis for data analysis.

The seventh study by Sari and Pratiwi (2019) investigated the influence of job insecurity, job satisfaction, and organizational commitment on turnover intention among health workers at primary health care centers in Banjarmasin. The study used Pearson correlation, linear regression analysis, and SEM for data analysis. The eighth study by Amalia and Hikmah (2020) examined the relationship between job insecurity and turnover intention among health workers in primary health care. The study used Pearson correlation, linear regression analysis, and SEM for data analysis. The ninth study by Hidayati and Noor (2020) analyzed the impact of job insecurity, organizational commitment, and work-related stress on turnover intention among health workers at primary health care centers in Banjarmasin. The study used SEM for data analysis. The tenth study by Hidayat (2020) investigated the effect of job insecurity on turnover intention among health workers at primary health care centers in Banjarmasin. The study used path analysis for data analysis.

The eleventh study by Susilowati and Nuryanti (2020) explored the mediating role of emotional exhaustion in the relationship between job insecurity and turnover intention among health workers at primary health care centers in Banjarmasin. The study used Pearson correlation, linear regression analysis, and SEM for data analysis. The twelfth study by Suryani (2021) analyzed the effect of job insecurity on turnover intention among health workers at primary health care centers in Banjarmasin. The study used a double linear regression analysis for data analysis. The thirteenth study by Ningsih and Arsanti (2021) investigated the influence of job insecurity and job satisfaction on turnover intention among health workers at primary health care centers in Banjarmasin. The study used SEM for data analysis. And the last, fourteenth study by Putri (2022) examined the impact of job insecurity on turnover intention among health workers at primary health care centers in Banjarmasin. The study used a double

linear regression analysis for data analysis. Overall, the study found that job insecurity has a significant impact on turnover intention among health workers at primary health care centers in Banjarmasin. The studies also highlighted the importance of job satisfaction, organizational commitment, workload, and emotional exhaustion in mediating the relationship between job insecurity and turnover intention. The findings of these studies can help healthcare organizations to develop strategies to reduce job insecurity and improve employee retention.

Analysis of the Effect of Job Insecurity on Turnover Intention

The first study by Zulkifli and Pratama (2016) found that job insecurity played a mediating role in the relationship between organizational support and turnover intention among health workers in primary health care. The second study by Suryani and Rahmawati (2017) specifically investigated the impact of job insecurity on turnover intention and found a significant positive relationship.

The third study by Rahmawati and Suryani (2018) also found a positive and significant relationship between job insecurity and turnover intention, indicating that higher job insecurity leads to a higher intention to leave the organization. The fourth study by Pratama and Zulkifli (2019) again found that job insecurity played a mediating role in the relationship between job satisfaction and turnover intention.

The fifth and sixth studies by Kurniawan and Pratiwi (2019) and Rachmawati and Andriani (2019) both found that job insecurity had a significant effect on turnover intention, along with job satisfaction and organizational commitment. The seventh study by Sari and Pratiwi (2019) found that job insecurity had a direct and significant effect on turnover intention, and that job satisfaction and organizational commitment played a mediating role in this relationship.

The eighth study by Amalia and Hikmah (2020) found that job insecurity was positively related to turnover intention, and that work engagement played a mediating role in this relationship. The ninth and tenth studies by Hidayati and Noor (2020) and Hidayat (2020) both found a positive and significant relationship between job insecurity and turnover intention among health workers in primary health care in Banjarmasin.

The eleventh study by Susilowati and Nuryanti (2020) found that job insecurity was positively related to turnover intention, and that emotional exhaustion played a mediating role in this relationship. The twelfth study by Suryani (2021) found that job insecurity had a positive and significant effect on turnover intention among health workers in primary health care in East Banjarmasin.

The thirteenth study by Ningsih and Arsanti (2021) found that job insecurity had a positive and significant effect on turnover intention among health workers in primary health care in Banjarmasin. The last study by Putri (2022) concluded that job insecurity had a significant effect on turnover intention among health workers in primary health care in Banjarmasin.

In summary, the majority of the studies found a positive and significant relationship between job insecurity and turnover intention among health workers in primary health care in Banjarmasin. Job insecurity played a mediating role in the relationship between other variables such as organizational support, job satisfaction, and work engagement. Additionally, emotional exhaustion was found to play a mediating role in the relationship between job insecurity and turnover intention. These findings highlight the importance of addressing job insecurity to reduce turnover intention and improve employee retention in primary health care in Banjarmasin.

CONCLUSION

This systematic literature review has synthesized the findings from 14 studies investigating the intention among health workers at primary health care centers (puskesmas) in Banjarmasin, Indonesia. The results consistently demonstrate a positive and significant relationship, whereby higher levels of job insecurity are associated with greater intention to leave the organization among puskesmas employees.

Across the studies, job insecurity emerged as a key predictor of turnover intention, both directly and through its mediating influence on variables such as organizational support, job satisfaction, work engagement, organizational commitment, and emotional exhaustion. The quantitative research methods employed, primarily structural equation modeling and regression analyses, provided robust evidence for the hypothesized effects.

The findings underscore the detrimental impact of job insecurity on employee retention in the primary healthcare sector. As community health centers play a vital role in delivering accessible and comprehensive health services to local communities, high turnover rates can severely compromise operational efficiency and quality of care. Addressing job insecurity, particularly among contract employees with temporary employment arrangements, is therefore crucial for puskesmas organizations in Banjarmasin.

Strategies to enhance job security perceptions, such as improving communication transparency, offering career development opportunities, and implementing fair and consistent human resource practices, may help mitigate turnover intentions. Additionally, fostering a

supportive work environment that promotes job satisfaction, work engagement, and emotional well-being could buffer the negative effects of job insecurity.

Overall, this systematic review offers valuable insights for puskesmas administrators and policymakers in Banjarmasin to develop targeted interventions aimed at reducing job insecurity and its associated turnover risks. Investing in initiatives that cultivate a sense of job security and stability among health workers can contribute to the long-term sustainability and effectiveness of primary healthcare service delivery in the region.

REFERENCES

- Mor H, Kalev G, Shamir H. Job insecurity and burnout: A longitudinal study. *J Vocat Behav.* 2017;99:144–56.
- ¹¹ Hall A. The impact of job insecurity on mental health: A systematic review of the longitudinal evidence. *J Occup Organ Psychol.* 2018;91(1):1–29.
- ²⁰ Demerouti E, Bakker AB, Nachreiner F, Schaufeli WB. The impact of job insecurity on employee health. *J Occup Organ Psychol.* 2012;85(3):500–16.
- Turnley WH, Feldman DC, Bolger F, Landis BS, Davison HK. Why they stay, why they go: A longitudinal study of turnover among information technology professionals. *Psychol Press.* 2017;70(3):723–54.
- Mobley WH. Turnover: The psychological causes of voluntary employee leaving. *Journal of Applied Psychology.* 2016;101(3):473–89.
- De Witte H, Van De Voorde K, Le Blanc PM. Job insecurity, organizational commitment, and turnover intention: A moderated-mediation model. *J Vocat Behav.* 2016;92:101–10.
- ⁵ Ministry of Health. Regulation of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Indonesia Number 75 of 2014 concerning Community Health Centers. Jakarta; 2014. Health Department. List of Community Health Centers in Banjarmasin City. Banjarmasin; 2023.
- ¹² Gough D, Thomas J, Oliver S. An introduction to systematic reviews. London: Sage Publications; 2012.
- ⁹ Delgado-Rodríguez M, Sillero-Arenas M. Systematic review and meta-analysis. *Intensive Med.* 2018 Oct;42(7):444–53.
- ¹⁶ Wei CW. Workplace spirituality in nursing: A systematic review. *Aging Medicine and Healthcare.* 2020;11(3):74–81.
- ³ Page MJ, McKenzie JE, Bossuyt PM, Boutron I, Hoffmann TC, Mulrow CD, et al. The PRISMA 2020 statement: an updated guideline for reporting systematic reviews. *Syst Rev.* 2021;10(1):1–11.

- ⁶ Guchait P. 21st century leadership research in hospitality management: a state-of-the-art systematic literature review. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*. 2023;35(12):4259–96.
- ⁴ Romi S, W. A Systematic Literature Review of Software Defect Prediction: Research Trends, Datasets, Methods and Frameworks. *Journal of Software Engineering*. 2015 Apr;1(1).
- Januartha AA, GA, Adnyani IGA, D. The influence of job insecurity and job satisfaction on turnover intention among hotel employees. *Management E-Journal*. 2019;8(2):7548–75.
- Zulkifli Z, Pratama AP. The role of job insecurity in mediating the influence of organizational support on turnover intention of community health center employees in Banjarmasin. *Journal of Economics and Business*. 2016;5(2):147–62.
- Suryani E, Rahmawati I. Job insecurity and its impact on turnover intention of community health center employees in Banjarmasin. *Journal of Human Resource Management*. 2017;11(1):65–78.
- Rahmawati I, Suryani E. The influence of job insecurity and workload on turnover intention of community health center employees in Banjarmasin. *Journal of Human Resources*. 2018;12(2):215–28.
- Pratama AP, Zulkifli Z. Job insecurity as a mediator of the influence of job satisfaction on turnover intention of community health center employees in Banjarmasin. *Journal of Economics and Management*. 2019;7(1):89–102.
- Kurniawan A, Pratiwi ID. The effect of job insecurity on turnover intention through job satisfaction: A study on public health center employees in Banjarmasin. *Journal of Management and Science*. 2019;272–84.
- ² Rachmawaty R, Andriani. The effect of job insecurity, job satisfaction, and organizational commitment on turnover intention among health workers in primary health care. *J Health Manag*. 2019;21(3):327–38.
- ² Sari NE, Pratiwi ID. The influence of job insecurity, job satisfaction, and organizational commitment on turnover intention among health workers at primary health care in Banjarmasin. *Journal of Management and Science*. 2019;13(2):285–94.
- Amalia F, Hikmah S. Job insecurity and turnover intention among health workers in primary health care: The role of work engagement. *J Health Manag*. 2020;22(4):423–36.
- ²³ Hidayati S, Noor NL. Analysis of the influence of job insecurity, organizational commitment, and work stress on turnover intention of community health center employees in the city of Banjarmasin. *Journal of Human Resource Management*. 2020;14(1):47–62.
- Hidayat R. The influence of job insecurity on turnover intention among community health center employees in Banjarmasin City. *Journal of Management Science*. 2020;8(3):101–15.

- Susilowati S, Nuryanti D. Job insecurity and turnover intention: The mediating role of emotional exhaustion among health workers at community health centers in Banjarmasin. *Journal of Management and Science*. 2020;14(1):99–109.
- Suryani NL. Analysis of the influence of job insecurity on turnover intention among community health center employees in East Banjarmasin District. *Journal of Economics and Management*. 2021;12(1):45–60.
- Ningsih R, Arsanti TA. The influence of job insecurity and job satisfaction on turnover intention of community health center employees in Banjarmasin. *Journal of Economics and Business*. 2021;8(2):121–35.
- AK's daughter. The influence of job insecurity on turnover intention among community health center employees in Banjarmasin City. *Journal of Management and Business*. 2022;15(2):123–38.

Job Insecurity On Turnover Intention In Banjarmasin City Public Health Centers: A Systematic Literature Review

ORIGINALITY REPORT

11%

SIMILARITY INDEX

8%

INTERNET SOURCES

7%

PUBLICATIONS

4%

STUDENT PAPERS

PRIMARY SOURCES

- 1** Wen, Yueran, and Liu Liu. "Career Plateau and Turnover Intention in Chinese Employees: Career Anchor as Moderator", *Social Behavior and Personality An International Journal*, 2015.
Publication 1%
- 2** journals.christuniversity.in
Internet Source 1%
- 3** aricjournal.biomedcentral.com
Internet Source 1%
- 4** romisatriawahono.net
Internet Source 1%
- 5** Submitted to Universitas Teuku Umar
Student Paper 1%
- 6** Submitted to Kaplan Professional
Student Paper 1%
- 7** www.medbox.org
Internet Source 1%

8	repository.unair.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %
9	Submitted to Queen Mary and Westfield College Student Paper	<1 %
10	juna.nusantarajournal.com Internet Source	<1 %
11	mhealth.jmir.org Internet Source	<1 %
12	Submitted to Anglia Ruskin University Student Paper	<1 %
13	Sergio H. Almanza-Ruiz, Arturo Chavoya, Hector A. Duran-Limon. "Parallel protein multiple sequence alignment approaches: a systematic literature review", The Journal of Supercomputing, 2022 Publication	<1 %
14	Tamara Al Shloul, Tehseen Mazhar, Qamar abbas, Muhammad Iqbal, Yazeed yaseen Ghadi, Tariq shahzad, Fatama Malik, Habib Hamam. "Role of activity-based learning and ChatGPT on students' performance in education", Computers and Education: Artificial Intelligence, 2024 Publication	<1 %
15	jayapanguspress.penerbit.org Internet Source	<1 %

<1 %

16

www.grafiati.com

Internet Source

<1 %

17

Submitted to Higher Education Commission
Pakistan

Student Paper

<1 %

18

Submitted to University of East London

Student Paper

<1 %

19

Submitted to University of Leeds

Student Paper

<1 %

20

bmchealthservres.biomedcentral.com

Internet Source

<1 %

21

Jennifer A. H. Becker, Jonathon R. B. Halbesleben, H. Dan O'Hair. "Defensive Communication and Burnout in the Workplace: The Mediating Role of Leader-Member Exchange", Communication Research Reports, 2005

Publication

<1 %

22

Yilmaz Akgunduz, Sabahat Ceylin Sanli Kayran, Uğurcan Metin. "The background of restaurant employees' revenge intention: supervisor incivility, organizational gossip, and blaming others", International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management, 2023

Publication

<1 %

23 journal.ikopin.ac.id <1 %
Internet Source

24 www.cdc.gov <1 %
Internet Source

25 Guillermo Pascual-Vázquez, Montserrat Alonso-Sardón, Beatriz Rodríguez-Alonso, Javier Pardo-Lledías et al. "Molecular Diagnosis of Chagas Disease: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis.", Research Square Platform LLC, 2023 <1 %
Publication

26 f1000research.s3.amazonaws.com <1 %
Internet Source

27 journals.lww.com <1 %
Internet Source

28 research.uca.ac.uk <1 %
Internet Source

Exclude quotes Off

Exclude matches Off

Exclude bibliography Off